Case 5:09-cv-06058-RMW Document 56 Filed 02/10/12 Page 1 of 3 1 2 3 4 **E-FILED on** 2/10/125 6 7 IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT 8 9 FOR THE NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA 10 SAN JOSE DIVISION 11 12 CHANG MIN LU AND LI FEN LEE, ON No. C-09-6058 RMW BEHALF OF THEMSELVES AND ALL 13 SIMILARLY SITUATED OTHERS, Plaintiff, ORDER DENYING APPROVAL OF 14 SETTLEMENT 15 v. 16 PACIFIC RIM ENTERPRISES, FANNY KING AND JIM SIEVERS, 17 Defendants. 18 19 20 The settlement of any claim brought under the California Private Attorneys General Act 21 (PAGA) requires court approval. See Cal. Lab. Code § 2699(1). In this case, the court does not feel 22 it can approve an agreement that provides no consideration for the settlement of plaintiff's PAGA 23 claim, yet purports to bar employees similarly situated from filing potentially valid PAGA claims 24 without first providing them with notice. The court recognizes its concern is largely academic, but 25 is troubled by approving a settlement in which employee claims are unknowingly dismissed with 26 prejudice for zero dollars while a significant monetary award is allocated to the named plaintiff. The

court would be happy to approve a settlement under which the PAGA claim is dismissed with

prejudice as to the named plaintiff but without prejudice as to others similarly situated.

ORDER DENYING APPROVAL OF SETTLEMENT —No. C-09-6058 CB

27

28

1			p		
2	DATED:	February 10, 2012	RONALD M. WHY? United States District	M. Whest	<u>_</u> 2
3		1 cordary 10, 2012	 RONALD M. WHY? United States District	TE Judge	
4					
5					
6					
7					
8					
9					
10					
11					
12					
13					
14					
15					
16					
17					
18					
19					
20					
21					
22					
23					
24					
25					
26					
27					
28					

ORDER DENYING APPROVAL OF SETTLEMENT —No. C-09-6058

CB

Case 5:09-cv-06058-RMW Document 56 Filed 02/10/12 Page 3 of 3 Notice of this document has been electronically sent to: **Counsel for Plaintiffs:** email name **Counsel for Defendants:** name email Counsel are responsible for distributing copies of this document to co-counsel that have not registered for e-filing under the court's CM/ECF program. Dated: **Chambers of Judge Whyte**